

Type of document	ASI Suspension Request Report
Scope	Public after finalisation
Status of document	Final
Date:	31 January 2009
Report drafted by:	Paolo Tranquillini
Contact email:	p.tranquillini@accreditation-services.com
Approval body	ASI Accreditation Committee
Deadline for approval	-
Document Title:	Request for suspension of ICILA for FM evaluations in Cameroon
ASI reference code:	ASI-REP-122-ICILA-2009-Suspension CAMEROON

RECOMMENDATION:

ASI-Accreditation Services International GmbH recommends to the ASI Accreditation Committee to approve disciplinary measures against ICILA srl (ICILA) by suspending ICILA accreditation (FSC-ACC-014) for performing new FSC forest management evaluations, and issuing or re-issuing FSC forest management certificates in Cameroon, until all relevant major corrective actions requests presented in this report have been closed. During the suspension period, ICILA will only be allowed to perform annual surveillance audit to maintain existing FSC certificates until their expiry date.

ASI shall perform a Forest Management field assessments of ICILA in Cameroon to ensure that all corrective action requests have been closed and will report to ASI Accreditation Committee before the suspension decision can be reconsidered.

If ICILA has not demonstrated compliance with all major corrective action requests within 6 months from the date of the suspension decision, ICILA accreditation for Cameroon will be terminated.

EVIDENCE

From the 31 July to 08 August 2008, ASI performed a forest management surveillance audit of ICILA at SEFAC concessions, Cameroon (CMR), certificate holder ICILA-FM/COC-000181.

Following this surveillance audit, ASI (final report 26 September 2008) proposed 1 major CAR and 4 minor CARs and ASI concluded the following:

“During this ASI surveillance audit, ICILA’s audit team performed a thorough and detailed audit. This audit outlined a large number of nonconformities with FSC certification requirements, some of them major nonconformities, which were adequately addressed by ICILA’s audit team. However, some of these non-conformities could and should have been identified by ICILA and addressed by the company following ICILA’s main assessment in November 2006 and ICILA’s complementary audit in July 2007.

During this ICILA surveillance audit, ICILA’s audit team raised against the company 3 major and 18 minor corrective action requests. Some of them will have to be addressed by the company within 6 months after ICILA’s audit. ASI recommends ICILA to check compliance with these corrective action requests through a new field surveillance audit by the 6 months timeline specified ICILA’s audit team; i.e. 08 February 2009.

Based on the findings of this ASI surveillance audit, the ASI audit team proposes one major corrective action request regarding ICILA’s standard for Cameroon, and 4 minor corrective action requests which will need to be addressed by ICILA within the timeframe specified.

ASI recommends to FSC AC maintaining ICILA’s accreditation for forest management evaluations worldwide, subject to the timely closing of all the nonconformities identified during this ASI surveillance assessment, as specified in the nonconformity reports (attached). Failure to demonstrate compliance with the major nonconformity within the specified timeframe will result in a report to the FSC Executive Director recommending disciplinary measures”.

One major CAR (**CAR.ICILA.FM.CMR.2008.03**) and one minor CAR (**CAR.ICILA.FM.CMR.2008.01**) had a timeline of 25 December 2008 (3 months from the finalization of the ASI report). ASI has still not received appropriate documented evidence to close these 2 CARs and therefore recommends the minor CAR to be upgraded to a major CAR and recommends the suspension of ICILA’s accreditation for Cameroon until conformity with the two ASI major CARs has been demonstrated.

ASI findings for CAR.ICILA.FM.CMR.2008.01:

ICILA awarded a certificate to SEFAC on 20 September 2007. However, at the time of the ASI surveillance audit in August 2008, there was evidence that the company was not in compliance with many FSC certification requirements.



During their main assessment (29 November - 10 December 2006) ICILA had issued to the forest management 2 major CARs and 8 minor CARs. ICILA performed a supplementary audit (22 - 31 July 2007), closed the CARs and issued the certificate on 20 September 2007.

	weight	ICILA FM STD ref.	Status
01	minor	1.1.1 – 1.1.3 – 2.1.3	All closed before or at the end of ICILA supplementary audit 31 Jul 07
02	MAJOR	FSC-POL-20-001	
03	minor	3.1.3 – 3.1.7 – 3.1.8	
04	minor	1.1.1	
05	minor	5.1.3	
06	MAJOR	9.1.1 – 9.2.1	
07	minor	6.7.1	
08	minor	7.2.1 – 8.4.1	
09	minor	1.1.1	
10	minor	4.1.2	

From ICILA public summary Oct 07

During the first surveillance audit (31 July - 08 August 2008) ICILA has issued to the forest management 5 major CARs and 19 minor CARs.

	weight	ICILA FM STD ref.	Status
01	minor	1.1.2	
02	minor	2.2.2	
03	minor	2.2.3	
04	minor	3.1.5	
05	minor	3.3.3	
06	minor	3.3.2	
07	minor	4.4.1	
08	MAJOR	4.2.3	To be closed within 3 months
09	minor	4.2.5	
10	minor	4.2.6	
11	minor	4.2.8	
12	minor	4.3.4	
13	minor	5.6.3	
14	MAJOR	6.5.a.2	To be closed within 6 months
15	minor	6.6.a.1	
16	MAJOR	6.6.b.1	Closed before the end of audit
17	minor	6.7.1	
18	MAJOR	7.4	To be closed within 3 months
19	minor	8.2.d	
20	minor	1.5.1	
21	minor	9.3.1	
25	minor	9.4.1	
26	MAJOR	7.3.5	To be closed within 6 months
27	minor	4.2.2	

From ICILA surveillance public summary



During the ASI surveillance audit, ICILA's audit team addressed most of the nonconformities identified with appropriate corrective action requests. However, some of these nonconformities should have been identified and addressed during ICILA's main assessment in November 2006 and ICILA's complementary audit in July 2007.

FSC standard FSC-STD-20-001, section 19.1, requires a certification body not to issue a certificate if there are outstanding major non-compliances with the FSC Principles and Criteria.

ASI issued:

CAR.ICILA.FM.CMR.2008.01	
MAJOR	ICILA issued a certificate to the company despite the fact that there was evidence that the company was not in compliance with many FSC certification requirements. During this ASI surveillance audit, ICILA's audit team addressed most of the nonconformities with appropriate corrective action requests. FSC standard FSC-STD-20-001, section 19.1, requires a certification body not to issue a certificate if there are outstanding major non-compliances with the FSC Principles and Criteria.
Reference	FSC-STD-20-001, section 19.1
Timeline	3 months from finalization of report (thus 25 December 2008)

ICILA performed a follow-up audit on 20-22 December 2008, at the offices of the company in Douala, CMR, and evaluated the corrective actions taken by the company regarding the 4 pending major CARs (n. 08, 14, 18 and 26).

The ICILA follow-up audit in December 2008 was a documentary and office evaluation, but did not assess the operational performance in the field. The evidence provided is not sufficient to close the above minor **CAR.ICILA.FM.CMR.2008.01** within the timeframe, thus ASI proposes to upgrade this minor CAR to a major CAR.

ASI findings for CAR.ICILA.FM.CMR.2008.03:

ICILA's locally adapted standard for Cameroon (icila2203 version 2 dated 30-07-06) states in the annexes that "*annexes are being translated in French for the final version*". Version 2 of ICILA's standard for Cameroon was at the time of the ASI audit only a draft standard as indicated in the standard itself (FSC-STD-20-003, sections 4.1 and 4.7).

Version 2 of ICILA's standard does not include:

- multilateral environmental agreements and ILO Conventions that the country has ratified (FSC-STD-20-003, section 2.1.b).
- list of, or reference to official lists of, endangered species in Cameroon (FSC-STD-20-003, section 2.1.c).
- all the national forest laws and administrative requirements which apply in Cameroon are included in the annexes to the standard (FSC-STD-20-003, section 2.1.a).

ICILA's locally adapted standard for Cameroon (icila2203 version 2 dated 30-07-06) has been reviewed by ASI before the ASI surveillance audit and has been discussed with ICILA's audit team. ICILA's standard for Cameroon is not in compliance with FSC accreditation requirements (FSC-STD-20-002, sections 3.1, 3.7, 3.10, 3.11, 3.13).



ICILA's locally adapted standard for Cameroon (icila2203 version 2 dated 30-07-06) shall be revised to ensure full compliance with FSC requirements.

CAR.ICILA.FM.CMR.2008.03	
MAJOR	ICILA's standard for Cameroon is not in compliance with FSC accreditation requirements (FSC-STD-20-002, sections 3.1, 3.7, 3.10, 3.11, 3.13 and FSC-STD-20-003, sections 2.1.a, 2.1.b, 2.1.c, 4.1 and 4.7).
Reference	FSC-STD-20-002, sections 3.1, 3.7, 3.10, 3.11, 3.13 FSC-STD-20-003, sections 2.1.a, 2.1.b, 2.1.c, 4.1 and 4.7
Timeline	3 months from finalization of report (thus 25 December 2008)

ICILA did not provide sufficient evidence to close the above major **CAR.ICILA.FM.CMR.2008.03** within the timeframe, thus ASI proposes disciplinary measures.

CONCLUSION

ASI identified major nonconformities with FSC accreditation requirements for forest management by ICILA in relation to their FSC certification activities in Cameroon.

The instances of major non conformities outline a breakdown in the implementation of ICILA's accredited procedures and create a risk for the credibility of the FSC in Cameroon.

ASI-Accreditation Services International GmbH recommends to the ASI Accreditation Committee to approve disciplinary measures against ICILA srl (ICILA) by suspending ICILA accreditation (FSC-ACC-014) for performing new FSC forest management evaluations, and issuing or re-issuing FSC forest management certificates in Cameroon, until all relevant major corrective actions requests presented in this report have been closed. During the suspension period, ICILA will only be allowed to perform annual surveillance audit to maintain existing FSC certificates until their expiry date.

ASI shall perform a Forest Management field assessments of ICILA in Cameroon to ensure that all corrective action requests have been closed and will report to ASI Accreditation Committee before the suspension decision can be reconsidered.

If ICILA has not demonstrated compliance with all major corrective action requests within 6 months from the date of the suspension decision, ICILA accreditation for Cameroon will be terminated.

